

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

| In the Matters of Chanel Lorenzo and<br>Rashid Odoms, Keyboarding Clerk 2<br>(PC0159V), Union County<br>CSC Docket Nos. 2018-474<br>2018-492 | :<br>:<br>d : | FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION<br>OF THE<br>CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION |                     |      |
|--|---------------|---|---------------------|------|
|  | :             | Ex  | Examination Appeals |      |
|  | :<br>:<br>:   |   |                     |      |
|  |               | ISSUED:   | February 13, 2020   | (RE) |

Chanel Lorenzo and Rashid Odoms appeal the determinations of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) which found that they did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Keyboarding Clerk 2 (PC0159V), Union County. These appeals have been consolidated due to common issues presented by the appellants.

The subject examination announcement was open to employees in the noncompetitive division who had an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date and were serving in the in-line title(s) Keyboarding Clerk 1 and Keyboarding Clerk 1 Bilingual in Spanish & English, and who meet the requirement of one year of clerical experience operating an alphanumeric keyboard or typewriter to produce documents such as letters, memos, reports, charts, forms and other materials. Successful completion of a clerical training program with a minimum of 700 clerical training hours or 30 semester hour credits in secretarial science from an accredited college or university could be substituted for the experience requirement. Coursework must have included keyboarding/typing skills, methods, and procedures; other courses may have included, but were not limited to, office procedures, word processing, and business English. These requirements had to be met as of the March 21, 2017 closing date. A total of seven employees applied for the subject examination which resulted in a list of two eligibles with an expiration date of August 2, 2020. The eligible list was certified once, and both eligible candidates failed the clerical performance examination.

The appellants listed experience in the title Keyboarding Clerk 1. Official records indicate that Ms. Lorenzo was provisionally appointed to the subject title on September 1, 2015, was provisionally appointed laterally to Clerk 2 on October 1, 2017, after the closing date, and was regularly appointed to Clerk 2 on March 25, 2019. Mr. Odoms was provisionally appointed to Clerk 2 on May 1, 2019, after the closing date. None of the experience listed by either appellant was found to be applicable, and therefore the appellants were each found to be lacking one year of required experience.

On appeal, each appellant argues that she or he meets the minimum requirements. Each maintains that she or he utilizes a keyboard to record, index, verify, scan, and manage records.

## CONCLUSION

*N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.6(a) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the promotional examination announcement by the closing date.

In the instant matter, credit was given only for clerical experience operating an alphanumeric keyboard or typewriter to produce documents such as letters, memos, reports, charts, forms and other materials. The list of duties provided by the appellants included the following responsibilities: receiving, reviewing, checking and recording legal documents; typing addresses or labels; reviewing documents for completeness; hand-stamping and scanning documents; providing information to the public and clients; annotating documents; and managing the storage of records and documents; opening, sorting, hand-stamping and distributing mail; and calculating and receiving fees. While personal computers and other machines, printers, scanners and equipment can be utilized in almost any position, the required experience is specific to utilizing a keyboard to produce documents. While a few of the duties may pertain to the Keyboarding Clerk title series, such as typing addresses or typing information on forms, the majority of the work performed by the appellants does not match the announced requirements. Rather, the duties listed on the appellants' applications suggest that their positions should be classified in the Clerk title series. As such, the appellants do not meet the minimum experience qualifications for the subject title.

An independent review of all material presented indicates that the decision of the Agency Services that appellants did not meet the announced requirements for eligibility by the closing date are amply supported by the record. The appellants provide no basis to disturb these decisions. Thus, the appellants have failed to support their burden of proof in these matters. Therefore, it is ordered that these appeals be denied.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE 12<sup>th</sup> DAY OF FEBRUARY, 2020

Derrare' L. Webster Calib

Deirdré L. Webster Cobb Chairperson Civil Service Commission

Inquiries and Correspondence Christopher S. Myers Director Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs Civil Service Commission Written Record Appeals Unit P. O. Box 312 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Chanel Lorenzo (CSC Docket No. 2018-474) Rashid Odoms (CSC Docket No. 2018-492) Joanne Rajoppi Kelly Glenn Records Center